



# CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

12th Floor, Municipal Services Building  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
(215) 686-6680  
FAX (215) 686-3832  
alan.butkovitz@phila.gov

ALAN BUTKOVITZ  
City Controller  
[www.philadelphiacontroller.org](http://www.philadelphiacontroller.org)

September 23, 2015

William R. Hite, Jr. Ed.D  
Superintendent of Schools  
Philadelphia School District  
440 N. Broad St.  
Philadelphia, Pa 19130

Dear Dr. Hite:

As a follow-up to my Office's June 2015 report on the conditions of Philadelphia's Public School buildings, we recently inspected 15 of the initial 20 schools to determine if any action was taken to improve the hazardous conditions uncovered by our inspectors. These selected schools were determined to need the most work.

After conducting our inspections, we found the School District took immediate steps to make several improvements based on our recommendations. Our inspectors found a substantial amount of the maintenance work had been completed over the summer break prior to students and staff returning for the new school year.

The enclosed report contains a status update to prior findings as well as before-and-after photographs to display the work that was completed. The asbestos that was exposed at Francis Scott Key Elementary has been encapsulated, properly sealed and the plaster ceiling above it has been repaired. The heating system that was leaking in Frankford High School's basement now has new pumps and isolation valves so water does not escape. Additionally, many schools have new ceiling tiles, fresh paint and GFCI electrical outlets have been installed to meet industry standards.

As a result of our report, we were informed that the School District also developed a detailed remediation plan of action to address the types of issues that were found in our initial report. Along with taking corrective actions, the School District indicated that it has established plans to utilize capital funds to address some of the larger and more expensive issues.

I commend your effort and commitment to quickly addressing these unsafe conditions. While there is still much work to be done, this was an enormous leap forward to creating a safe learning environment for students, teachers and other essential staff that assist the School District in its daily operations.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Alan Butkovitz".

ALAN BUTKOVITZ  
City Controller

# **PHILADELPHIA SCHOOL DISTRICT**

## **Follow-up Review of Conditions at School Buildings**

**September 2015**

In our June 2015 report the Controller's Office recommended that the Philadelphia School District develop a detailed corrective action plan to address the findings that were presented in the review.

We also recommended management take the following actions to address the deficiencies found in our review. These issues are low cost items that could be completed by the school maintenance staff.

- Cover exposed wires
- Install GFCI outlets where appropriate
- Locate leaks and address as necessary
- Unblock fire exits
- Repair fire signs as necessary
- Update fire extinguishers as necessary
- Establish and maintain a regularly scheduled fire extinguisher maintenance program
- Repair safety surfaces and other tripping hazards
- Inspect all toilets and immediately address those that are unsanitary
- Unclog area drains
- Repair insulation in occupied areas at a minimum
- Check mechanical rooms for leaking; develop a plan to identify and correct the existing problems

As a result of our report we were informed that the School District had developed a detailed remediation plan of action to address the types of issues that were found in our audit. A substantial amount of the maintenance issues at the schools that were inspected by our office have been corrected and plans are in place to utilize capital funds to address some of the larger and more expensive issues. The School District intends to initially make improvements to those schools we inspected and eventually/subsequentially expand their improvements district wide.

The Controller's Office visited 15 of the 20 schools indicated in our audit as a follow up to our report and the School District's plans. (Those 15 schools were revealed in our prior inspections as needing the most work.) During our visits we met with the building engineer and verified that the work had been preformed, and were also provided with a list of completed work for each school. Our inspectors found that a substantial amount of the maintenance work had been completed at these schools. Although the majority of the more expensive work had not yet been completed, we were told that that work would take more time because most of these improvements would require capital funding. The School District appeared to have taken our audit seriously and worked hard to repair many of the items from the report.

The following 15 schools were re-inspected as part of the City Controller's follow-up review:

1. Dimner Beeber Middle School (5925 Malvern Avenue)
2. Julia DeBurgos Elementary School (401 W. Lehigh Avenue)
3. Frankford High School (5000 Oxford Avenue)
4. Andrew Jackson Elementary School (1213 S. 12<sup>th</sup> Street)
5. General Phillip Kearny Elementary School (601 Fairmount Avenue)
6. Francis Scott Key Elementary School (2230 S. 8<sup>th</sup> Street)
7. Delaplaine McDaniel Elementary School (2100 Moore Street)
8. Martha Washington Elementary School (766 N. 44<sup>th</sup> Street)
9. George Washington High School (10175 Bustleton Avenue)
10. Bayard Taylor Elementary School (3698 N. Randolph Street):
11. Crossan Elementary School (7350 Bingham Street)
12. Central High School (1700 W. Olney Avenue)
13. John Story Jenks Elementary School (8301 Germantown Avenue)
14. McKinley Elementary School (2101 N. Orkney Street)
15. Overbrook Educational Center (6722 Landsdowne Avenue)

The following pages contain the before and after pictures (left and right respectively) of some of the larger issues that were addressed.



**Frankford High** - Before - Severely Damaged Plaster 2nd Floor Hallway. After - New plaster repairs and fresh paint throughout the school.



**Frankford High** - Before - Heating System circulator pumps leaking and bad bearings. After - All new circulating pumps and isolation valves installed on the heating system.



**Crossan Elementary** - Before - No railings in stairwells. After - New railings installed at all stairways.





**Crossan Elementary** - Before - No GFCI next to a water fountain. After - New GFCI's installed throughout.



**Francis Scott Key Elementary** - Before - Asbestos wrapping in bad shape. After - Asbestos insulation encapsulated, properly sealed, plaster ceiling repaired and freshly painted.



**Francis Scott Key Elementary** - Before - Flaking and peeling paint. After - Completely scraped and freshly painted.





**Delaplaine McDaniel Elementary School** – Before - damaged ceiling tiles. After – Tiles were replaced.



**Delaplaine McDaniel Elementary School** – Before - Broken stall doors in the girls room. After – Doors were repaired.



**Delaplaine McDaniel Elementary School** – Before - Damaged sidewalk. After – Sidewalk was patched.









**Bayard Taylor Elementary School** – Before - Damaged plaster. After - Plaster work in progress.



**Bayard Taylor Elementary School** – Before - Water fountain missing a GFCI outlet. After - GFCI outlet installed.



**Bayard Taylor Elementary School** – Before - Broken glass in a classroom door. After - Glass repaired.





**Bayard Taylor Elementary School** – Before - Dampness in stairwell. After - Painting in progress.



**Bayard Taylor Elementary School** – Before - Wires were improperly terminated. After - Wires are capped.



**Andrew Jackson Elementary School** – Before - Boxes in the electrical panel area. After - Boxes moved away from electrical panel and access provided.





**Andrew Jackson Elementary School** – Before - Damaged outlet with exposed wires. After - Repaired outlet and wires.



**Andrew Jackson Elementary School** –Before - Tripping hazard near tree pit. After - New sidewalk around tree pit.



**General Kearny Elementary School** - Before - Tripping hazard at tree pit. After - A new tree pit.





**General Kearny Elementary School** - Before - Water fountain without a GFCI outlet. After - GFCI outlet installed.



**Central High School** – Before - Leak from the ceiling. After - Leak fixed and tiles replaced.



**Central High School** – Before - Outlet near a water source without a GFCI outlet. After - GFCI outlet installed.





**George Washington High School** – Before - Buckled floor. After - Floor repaired.



**George Washington High School** – Before - Damaged tile floor. After - Floor repaired.



**George Washington High School** – Before - Exterior tripping hazard. After - Repair in progress.